UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06103624 0

COMPARATIVE CRIMINAL LAW

VOLUME 1

Professor Markus Dubber

Fall 2010

Storage

K
5015.4
.D816
2010
v.1
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 17 2010
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

COMPARATIVE CRIMINAL LAW

VOLUME 1

Professor Markus Dubber

Fall 2010

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/comparativecrimi01dubb_0

Table of Contents

I. Preliminary

A. Punishment: Concept, Form, Limits 1

1. The Concept of Punishment 1

a. Rationales: deterrence, retribution, incapacitation, rehabilitation, "positive general prevention" 1

• *United States v. Blarek*, 7 F. Supp. 2d 192 (E.D.N.Y. 1998) (U.S. sentencing guidelines in money laundering case) 1

• BVerfGE 45, 187 14

• Streng, "Sentencing in Germany: Basic Questions and New Developments" 16

• Nestler, "Sentencing in Germany" 18

• Dubber, "Theories of Crime and Punishment in German Criminal Law" 20

b. The Victim's Role 25

(i) Compensation and Restitution 25

• Uniform Victims of Crime Act 25

• Dubber, Victims in the War on Crime 27

• StGB § 46a 28

• Frehsee, "Restitution and Offender-Victim-Arrangement in German Criminal Law" 29

(ii) Sentencing 29

• *Payne v. Tennessee*, 501 U.S. 808 (1991) (victim impact statements in capital cases) 30

• Hörnle, "Distribution of Punishment: The Role of the Victim's Perspective" 31

• Dubber, "The Victim in American Penal Law" 33

2. The Form of Punishment 35

a. Fine 35

• United States Sentencing Guidelines § 5E1.2 (Fines for Individual Defendants) (with Commission Commentary) 37

• Greene, "Structuring Criminal Fines: Making an 'Intermediate' Penalty More Useful and Equitable" 38

• § 40 StGB 38

b. Punishment vs. measure 38

• *Kansas v. Hendricks*, 521 U.S. 346 (1997) (indefinite detention of "sexual predators") 39

• BVerfGE 109, 133 (constitutionality of preventive detention) 43

• Hörnle, "Human-Rights Issues in the General Part of Substantive Criminal Law: German Constitution, Penal Code and Court Practice" 53

3. Limits on Punishment 55

a. Ultimate sanctions: Death and life imprisonment (Quality) 55

• *Gregg v. Georgia*, 428 US 153 (1976) (constitutionality of death penalty) 55

• *Life Imprisonment Case*, BVerfGE 45, 187 (constitutionality of life imprisonment) 60
• Arts. 1, 2, 102 Grundgesetz (German Basic Law) 72
• Lane, "The Paradoxes of a Death Penalty Stance" 73
b. Proportionality (Quantity) 74
• *United States v. Angelos*, 345 F. Supp. 2d 1227 (D. Utah 2004) (60 years for gun possession) 74
• OLG Braunschweig NStZ-RR 2002, 75 (constitutionality of imprisonment for petty crimes) 77
B. Legality Principle 79
1. *nulla poena sine lege* 79
a. Retroactivity 79
• *Rogers v. Tennessee*, 532 U.S. 451 (2001) (retroactivity of judicial decisions) 79
• *Border Guard Case*, BGHSt. 39, 1 82
b. Vagueness 100
• *Chicago v. Morales*, 527 U.S. 41 (1999) (gang loitering) 100
• *Skilling v. United States*, 561 U.S. __ (2010) 101
• BVerfGE 87, 209 (violence in media, scope of the prohibition) 110
2. compulsory prosecution (*Legalitätsprinzip*) 116
• Davis, Administrative Law 116
• StPO §§ 152, 153, 153a; StGB §§ 258, 258a 117
• Dubber, "Comparative Criminal Law" 118
C. Constitutional limits on substantive criminal law 119
1. General Part 119
• *People v. Davis*, 33 N.Y.2d 221 (1973) 119
• Dubber, "Toward a Constitutional Law of Crime and Punishment" 122
• Hörnle, "Human-Rights Issues in the General Part of Substantive Criminal Law: German Constitution, Penal Code and Court Practice" 123
2. Special Part: *Rechtsgut* and Harm Principle 124
• *Lawrence v. Texas*, 539 U.S. 558 (2003) (homosexual sodomy) 124
• *Commonwealth v. Bonadio*, 490 Pa. 91 (1980) 127
• *R. Malmo-Levine*, [2003] 3 S.C.R. 571 129
• *Incest Case* NJW 2008 137
• Dubber, "Theories of Crime and Punishment in German Criminal Law" 162
D. Jurisdiction 170
• *People v. Carvajal*, 14 A.D.3d 165, 786 N.Y.S.2d 450 (2004) (territoriality) 170
• StGB §§ 3 ff. 174
E. Procedural Context 176
1. Overview of Criminal Process 176
• Whitebread & Slobogin, Criminal Procedure: An Analysis of Cases and Concepts 4th ed., 12-15 176
• Dubber, "American Plea Bargains, German Lay Judges, and the Crisis of Criminal Procedure" 179
2. Plea Bargaining 179
• Lynch, "The Impropriety of Plea Agreements: A Tale of Two Counties" 179

• Dubber, "American Plea Bargains, German Lay Judges, and the Crisis of Criminal Procedure" 182
F. Analysis of Criminal Liability 184
1. German Scheme 184
• Naucke, "German Criminal Law Theory's General System for Analyzing Criminal Acts" 184
• Dubber, "The Promise of German Criminal Law" 186
2. Model Penal Code Scheme 187
• Model Penal Code § 1.02(1) 187
• Analysis of Criminal Liability 188
3. Illustration: *Dudley and Stephens*, [1884] 14 QBD 273 DC 189

II. General Part
A. Offense Elements 192
1. Actus Reus (Objective Elements) 192
a. Voluntary Acts 192
• *State v. Tippetts*, 180 Or. App. 350 (2002) 192
• Martin v. State, 31 Ala. App. 334, 17 So. 2d 427 (1944) 194
• People v. Decina, 2 N.Y.2d 133, 138 N.E.2d 799, 157 N.Y.S.2d 558 (1956) 195
• OLG Hamm, NJW 1979, 438 (being transported from the scene of an accident) 196
• OLG Hamm NJW 1975, 657 198
b. Constitutional Constraints 201
• *People v. Davis*, 33 N.Y.2d 221 (1973) 201
c. Possession 204
• *People v. Desthers*, 73 Misc. 2d 1085, 343 N.Y.S.2d 887 (1973) (weapons) 204
• *People v. E.C.*, 195 Misc. 2d 680, 761 N.Y.S.2d 443 (2003) (drugs) 208
• OLG Zweibrücken, AnwBl. 1983, 126 (drug possession) 210
o Dubber, "Policing Possession" 215
o Model Penal Code § 2.01 217
o Texas Penal Code §§ 1.07, 6.01 217
o Prop. New Fed. Crim. Code § 301 217
d. Omissions 217
• *State v. Miranda*, 245 Conn. 209 (1998) 217
o Model Penal Code § 2.01 225
o German Penal Code § 13 226
o 12 Vt. Stat. Ann. § 519 226
o Wis. Stat. § 940.34 226
o German Penal Code § 323c 226
o German Penal Code (1935) § 330c 227
o Restatement (Second) of Torts § 314 227
• BGHSt. 48, 301 227
• BGHSt. 30, 391 231

• BGHSt. 23, 327 235
2. Mens Rea (Subjective Elements) 236
a. Modes of Culpability 236
• *People v. Baker*, A.D.3d 606 (N.Y. App. Div. 2004) 236
• Model Penal Code § 2.02 240
+ *R. v. G and another*, [2003] UKHL 50 (UK) (recklessness) 241
+ *R. v. Lewis*, [1979] 2 S.C.R. 821 (Can.) (motive) 253
• *AIDS Case*, BGHSt. 36, 1 (delineating the German concept of "intent") 259
• OLG Braunschweig NstZ-RR 1998, 175 268
• BGH NStZ 2003, 657 (negligence) 271
b. Strict Liability 273
• *Morissette v. United States*, 342 U.S. 246 (1952) (public welfare offenses) 273
• Sayre, "Public Welfare Offenses" 275
+ *R. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie*, (1978) 40 C.C.C. (2d) 353 (Can.) 277
c. Mistake 283
(i) As Element-Negating 283
• People v. Gudz, 18 A.D.3d 11, 793 N.Y.S.2d 556 (2005) 283
• § 16 I StGB 285
• BGH StV 2003, 393 (lack of knowledge concerning age of child) 286
• BGHSt. 37, 214 (error in persona) 286
(ii) As Excuse (Ignorance of Law) 290
• *People v. Marrero*, 69 N.Y.2d 382 (1987) 290
• *Border Guard Case*, BGHSt 39, 1 301
d. Intoxication 303
• *State v. Cameron*, 104 N.J. 42 (1986) 303
• § 323a StGB 307
• BGHSt. 37, 231 307
• BGHSt. 49, 239 312
3. Causation 319
• *People v. Kibbe*, 35 N.Y.2d 407 (1974) 319
• Model Penal Code § 2.03 322
• *Leather Spray Case* BGHSt. 37, 106 (lack of scientific knowledge establishing causality) 322
• BGHSt. 48, 34 (death through victim's attempt to escape attack) 336
4. Complicity 340
• *State v. Tally*, 102 Ala. 25 (1894); Model Penal Code § 2.06 340
• BGHSt. 11. 268 (co-offenders or accomplices?) 343
• *Staschynskij Case* BGHSt. 18, 87 345
• BGHSt. 40, 218 (boarder crimes, members of the GDR's National Security Council) 352
• Dubber, "Criminalizing Complicity: A Comparative Analysis" 359
5. Corporate criminal liability 364
• *N.Y. Central & Hudson River Railroad Co. v. United States*, 212 U.S. 481 (1909) 364

• *People v. Congregational Khal Chaisidei Skwere, Inc.*, 232 A.D.2d 919, 649 N.Y.S.2d 499 (1996) 366
+ Model Penal Code § 2.07*
• Weigend, "Societas delinquere non potest?: A German Perspective" 368
6. Inchoate offenses 375
a. Attempt 375
• *People v. Lehnert*, 163 P.3d 1111 (Colo. 2007) 375
• Model Penal Code § 5.01 379
• §§ 22, 24 StGB*
• BGHSt. 39, 236 381
• BGH NJW 1997, 3453 ("Bärwurz" Case) (beginning of attempt) 382
• BGHSt. 35, 184 (withdrawal from attempt) 386
b. Conspiracy 389
• *Pinkerton v. United States*, 328 U.S. 640 (1946) 389
• *People v. McGee*, 49 N.Y.2d 48 (1979) 390
• *People v. Berkowitz*, 50 N.Y.2d 333 (1980) 392
• People v. Washington, 8 N.Y.3d 565 (2007) 395
• *People v. Sisselman,* 147 A.D.2d 261, 542 N.Y.S.2d 801 (1989) 397
• Model Penal Code § 5.03*
• § 30 I StGB*
• BGHSt. 12, 306 (planning of crimes) 398
• § 129 StGB*
"Landser" Case BGH NJW 2005, 1668 (extremist rock band as criminal organization) 401
c. Solicitation 406
• *Benson v. People*, 57 Cal.2d 240 (1962) 406
• Model Penal Code § 5.02 407
• § 30 II StGB*
• BGHSt. 19, 339 (solicitation to commit felony rather than misdemeanor) 408
B. Justifications 409
1. Necessity 409
• *People v. Craig*, 78 N.Y.2d 616 (1991) (subjective vs. objective) 409
+ *R. v. Perka*, (1984) 14 C.C.C. (3d) 385 (Can.) 412
• BGHSt. 48, 255 (killing of a violent husband) 433
• *"Katzenkönig" Case* BGHSt. 35, 347, 349 (bizarre error about alleged danger) 441
• *Aviation Security Act Case*, BVerfG, 1 BvR 357/05 446
• Hörnle, "Hijacked Airplanes: May They Be Shot Down?" 449
2. Self-Defense & Defense of Another 451
• *People v. Goetz*, 68 N.Y.2d 96 (1986) (self-defense) 451
• *State v. Kelly,* 97 N.J. 178, 478 A.2d 364 (1984) (batter women syndrome) 456
+ *Gladstone Williams* [1987] 3 All ER 411 (defense of another) 462
• BGH NStZ 1987, 172 (limits on the use of firearms for self-defense) 464
• BGH NStZ-RR 2002, 203; BGH NStZ 2001, 590 (error about attack) 465

* In Code Supplement.

• *Daschner Case*, LG Frankfurt/Main, NJW 2005, 692 (torturing a kidnapper to rescue the kidnapped) 467
3. Consent 469
• *State v. George*, 937 S.W.2d 251 (Mo. Ct. App. 1996) 469
• Model Penal Code § 2.11 473
+ *R. v. Jobidon*, [1991] 2 S.C.R. 714 (Can.) 473
• BGHSt. 49, 166 (consenting to dangerous sexual practices) 482
4. Law Enforcement 488
• *Tennessee v. Garner*, 471 U.S. 1 (1985) (use of deadly force in arrest) 488
• NStZ 2005, 31 (use of deadly force in arrest) 491
C. Excuses 493
1. Duress 493
• *Dixon v. United States*, 548 U.S. 1 (2006) 493
• Model Penal Code § 2.09 499
• BGHSt. 5, 371 (perjury under threat of death) 499
2. Entrapment 502
• *People v. Calvano*, 30 N.Y.2d 199 (1972) 502
• Model Penal Code § 2.13 504
• BGHSt. 45, 321 (lesser punishment after entrapment) 505
• Ross, "Tradeoffs in Undercover Investigations: A Comparative Perspective," U Chi L Rev 516
3. Insanity 516
• *United States v. Ewing*, 494 F.3d 607 (7th Cir. 2007) 516
• Model Penal Code § 5.01*
• BGH StV 1995, 405 (schizophrenia exculpates) 521
• §§ 20, 21 StGB 522

III. Special Part
A. Protected Rights and Interests; Structure of the Special Part 523
1. Table of contents, StGB 523
2. Table of contents, Federal Criminal Code (Title 18, U.S.C.) 525
3. Table of contents, Model Penal Code (pts. I & II) 526
4. Table of contents, Canadian Criminal Code 527
B. Offenses Against the Person 527
1. Homicide 527
a. Murder 527
(i) Intentional and Depraved Indifference Murder 527
• *People v. Payne*, 3 N.Y.3d 266 (2004) 527
• § 211 StGB*
• BGH NJW 1993, 1664 (greed for money as murder) 530
• BGHSt. 23, 119 (killing a sleeping person as murder) 532
(ii) Felony Murder 534
• *People v. Burroughs*, 35 Cal.3d 824 (1984) 534
+ *R. v. Martineau*, [1990] 58 C.C.C. (3d) 353 (Can.) 542

* In Code Supplement.

• § 251 StGB*
• BGHSt. 38, 295 (shooting after bank robbery) 544
b. Manslaughter 547
(i) Voluntary Manslaughter (Murder with Provocation) 547
• *People v. Roche,* 98 N.Y.2d 70 (2002) 547
• § 213 StGB*
• BGH NStZ 2004, 500 (provocation) 550
(ii) Involuntary Manslaughter (Reckless Homicide) 551
• *Commonwealth v. Malone,* 354 Pa. 180 (1946) 551
• *Lederriemen Case*, BGHSt. 7, 363 (definitions of intent) 553
c. Negligent Homicide 557
• *People v. Beiter*, 77 A.D.2d 214 (N.Y. App. Div. 1980). 557
• BGHSt. 24, 31 (duties of care when driving under the influence of alcohol) 560
d. Assisted Suicide 563
• *People v. Duffy*, 79 N.Y.2d 611 (1992) (assisted suicide vs. indirect homicide) 564
• *Sirius Case* BGHSt. 32, 38 (deception about deadly consequences) 565
2. Reckless Endangerment 568
• *People v. Rodriguez*, 110 Misc. 2d 828, 442 N.Y.S.2d 948 (1981) (endangering firefighter through arson) 568
• BGHSt. 39, 322 (endangerment of others after arson) 570
3. Stalking 572
• *People v. Stuart*, 100 N.Y.2d 412 (2003) (vagueness, vs. harassment) 572
• § 238 StGB 577
C. Offenses Against Sexual Autonomy: Rape 577
• *State v. Rusk*, 289 Md. 230, 424 A.2d 720 (1981) 577
• *People v. Jovanovic*, 263 A.D.2d 182, 700 N.Y.S.2d 156 (1999) 581
• § 177 StGB*
• BGHSt. 44, 229 (rape through abuse of helplessness) 587
• Hörnle, "Penal Law and Sexuality: Recent Reforms in German Criminal Law" 590
D. Other Offenses 594
1. "Hate crimes" and Holocaust denial (StGB § 130) 594
• *State v. Wyant*, 64 Ohio St.3d 566 (1992) ("ethnic intimidation") 594
• *Auschwitz Denial Case* BGH NStZ 2001, 305 596
• Hörnle, "Offensive Behavior and German Penal Law," Buff Crim L Rev 603
2. *Rechtsbeugung* 604
• StGB § 339 604
• De Nike, "Judges on Trial: A Cultural View of the Prosecution of East German Jurists" 604
• *Mireles v. Waco*, 502 U.S. 9 (1991) (judicial immunity) 606
+ *People v. Feerick*, 93 N.Y.2d 433 (1999) (official misconduct) 608
+ "Judges Plead Guilty in Scheme to Jail Youths for Profit," NY Times, Feb 12, 2009 611

* In Code Supplement.

3. "Organized Crime" 612
a. RICO 612
• *People v. Capaldo*, 151 Misc. 2d 114, 572 N.Y.S.2d 989 (1991) 612
• StGB § 129. Forming criminal organisations 615
b. Money Laundering 615
• *United States v. Campbell*, 977 F.2d 854 (4th Cir. 1992) 616
• Kay, "Heat is on Attorneys in Drug Trafficking Cases: Florida Lawyer Is Accused of Taking 'Dirty Money'" 619
• Anne Bussenius, "Money Laundering by Defence Counsel: The Decision of the Federal Constitutional Court" 620
• § 261 StGB 623
c. Terrorism 625
• *R v G*, [2009] UKHL 13; [2009] 2 All ER 409 625
+ Dubber, "The War on Terror and U.S. Criminal Law" 632
• *La Belle* Case, BGH, Judgment 24 June 2005 – 5 StR 306/03, 25 NStZ 35 (2005), 57 NJW 3051 (2004) 636
• Jay S. Bybee (with John Yoo), Memorandum for Alberto R. Gonzales, Counsel to the President Re: Standards of Conduct for Interrogation under 18 U.S.C. §§ 2340-2340A 640
+ 18 U.S.C. §§ 2340-2340A 643
• The Prosecutor General at the Federal Supreme Court Karlsruhe, Criminal Complaint against Donald Rumsfeld et al., 3 ARP 156/06-2, 5 April 2007 644
+ Davidson v. British Columbia, Davidson v. British Columbia (Attorney General), [2006] B.C.J. No. 2630 651